STATE OF NEW YORK
STATE TAX COMMISSION

72767

In the Matter of an Instrument Executed

OPICINAL

by

200 E. 64th ST. CORP.

DETERMINATION

and

JOHN HANCOCK MUTUAL LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY

Applicant, 200 E. 64th St. Corp., has filed an application with the State Tax Commission pursuant to Article 11 of the Tax Law for a review of a determination by Arthur Maxwell, Associate Mortgage and Land Tax Examiner, Miscellaneous Tax Bureau, that an instrument executed by it and John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Company was subject to the mortgage recording tax.

Upon notice to all interested parties, a formal hearing was held before Lawrence A. Nemman, Hearing Officer, at the offices of the State Tax Commission, 80 Centre Street, New York, New York on September 15, 1971, at 9:15 A.M. Berg, Mezansky & Dorf, Esqs.

(David Berg, Esq. and John S. Dorf, Esq., of Counsel) appeared for 200 E. 64th St. Corp. J. Lee Rankin, Esq. (Isaac Donner, Esq., of Counsel) appeared for the City of New York. Alegander Weiss, Esq. appeared for the City Register of New York County. Edward E. Best, Esq. (Solomon Sies, Esq., of Counsel) appeared for the Miscellaneous Tax Bureau.

LESUE

Was a consolidation, modification and extension agreement between John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Company and 200 E. 64th St. Corp. recorded on June 30, 1970, in the office of the City

STATE OF HEW YORK
STATE TAX COMMISSION

TESST

In the Matton wil on trattoment Grecutor

VΔ

see e. a.m. cam.

111.55

JOHN HEALDOR BUTGAL LIFE THEURANCH COLPANY

Applicant, 200 J. Stin St. Cores, has fired an application with the State has Commission pursuant to Actif a II of the Yar Law for a raytaw of a determination by Arthur Passell, historists her yaya and land for Stannart, discolizateous Tan Sursen, that an instrument executed by it and John Pancock Mutual hims Instrume Company was executed by it and John Pancock Mutual hims Instrume Company was

DETERMINATION

Open notice to via interested parties, a formed hearing was held before bewrence A. Mewaring Officer, at the offices of the State fax Commission, 80 Centre Stress, was Mork, New Mork on September 1s, 1871, at 9.15 h.m. Berg, Moransky & Morf, Ergs. (Davie, Berg, Beg, and Scha S. Dort, St., of Counsel) supenced for 200 S. Edth St. Corp. 3. For Manish, Zen (Isaechonner, Lag., of Counsel) appeared for the City of Sew Cor. Nickender Weiss. Beq. appeared for the City of Sew Cor. Nickender Weiss. Beat, appeared for the City of Sounse, ser Sewice to Manish. Beat, appeared for the City of Sounse, appeared for the City of Sounse, appeared for the Seat, as a speared for the Miscellances was for the Miscellances was cure of Sounse, appeared for the Corps.

The a consolidation, whilestion and extension and accomment between John Mandock toyer liked Therrence company and 2 0 s. whin st. Corp. mecorded on Jude 20. Will. 12 to each accorded on Jude 20. Will. 12 to each accorded on Jude 20. Will.

Register of New York County subject to the mortgage recording tax, and if said instrument was subject to tax, what was the proper method of determining the amount of said tax?

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. On November 3, 1967, 64th Street-Third Avenue Associates, a New York partnership, (Associates) acquired, by assignment from the tenant therein named, the tenant's interest in a long-term ground lease to premises (the "Premises") 1081-1089 Third Ave. and 206 E. 64th Street, New York City, dated May 2, 1967, between Mardordic Realty Co. Inc., landlord, and United Equities Inc., tenant.
- 2. On March 12, 1968, "Associates", as the tenant by assignment, executed and delivered to First National Bank of Boston (First Boston) a first leasehold construction mortgage (the "Assigned Mortgage") covering such ground lease and the building and improvements which were to be erected on the Premises by Associates, to secure the payment of a mortgage note (the "Assigned Note") in the principal amount of \$5,500,000.00 and interest. A mortgage tax on the Assigned Mortgage of \$27,500.00 was paid at the time of the recording thereof on March 13, 1968.
- 3. On June 30, 1970, Associates assigned to its corporate nominee, 200 E. 64th St. Corp. (Taxpayer), by an assignment dated June 15, 1970, all of its interest in the ground lease covering the Premises and the new building and improvements which had been erected thereon (collectively called the "Leasehold"), subject to the Assigned Mortgage.

TORS WITH THE

- to the second of the control of the
- 2. In nearly 12, 1311, 15 catalogy, as the remain by assertance assertance and fell of the catenors and fell of the catenors and fell of the catenors and the catenors as a second and the catenors as a second of the actenors are actenors.
- The section of the contract of

- 4. On June 30, 1970, the following additional transactions contemporaneously took place:
- a.) pursuant to a Purchase Agreement entered into between Associates and John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Company, (Hancock) on March 12, 1968, (contemporaneously with the execution and delivery of the Assigned Note and Assigned Mortgage by Associates to First Boston on March 12, 1968), Hancock purchased the Leasehold from Taxpayer for a purchase price of \$1,00, subject to the Assigned Mortgage on the Leasehold held by Hancock in the unpaid principal amount of \$5,500,000.00.
- b.) pursuant to a Buy-Sell Agreement entered into on March 12, 1968, between First Boston and Hancock, First Boston assigned to Hancock the Assigned Mortgage and Assigned Note secured thereby, for a purchase price of \$5,500,000.00.
- c.) pursuant to said Purchase Agreement dated March 12,

 1968, Hancock, as Seller, and Taxpayer, as Purchaser, agreed to enter

 into the Consolidation, Modification and Extension Agreement

 (Consolidation Agreement) which provided, among other things, that

 the lien of the Assigned Mortgage was to be consolidated and merged

 with and into the interest in the Leasehold to be assigned to

 Hancock by Taxpayer, and that Hancock would sell the Leasehold to

 Taxpayer for a purchase price in the principal amount of \$5,500,000.00

 as "evidenced by the Assigned Note and secured by the Assigned Mortgage"

 and payable in monthly installments over a period of 40 years and

 nine months (with an interest factor of 7 1/2% per annum on

 reducing balances of such purchase price). In addition, the

Franceser in the second of the control of the contr

Associated interesting of the content of the content of the component (Enaconce) as content of the content of t

erron it. leat, between the soutent Agreement and content. First on the soutent of the content o

c.) oursesson to said derectors a recommand and high. 2.

Light, in number, as failer, and incurrent destinations and area and considered to make the first flower indexion and the constituent of the formation and the constituent of the const

Consolidation Agreement provided that Taxpayer would make an annual variable payment (a share of the operating profits based upon the formula contained in section 4 on page 4 thereof) to Hancock in an amount equal to 50% of the excess, if any, of the net annual rental income for each calendar year commencing with the calendar year 1971, over the sum of (%) the monthly installment payments made in each calendar year in reduction of the \$5,500,000.00 purchase price, plus (%i) \$70,000.00 (except that in calculating the annual variable payment with respect to the calendar year 1971, only the months of April through December, 1971, shall be taken into account). Further, it provided that Taxpayer could prepay the unpaid balance of such purchase price on or within 120 days after (a) the 249th monthly installment date, (b) the 309th monthly installment date, es (c) the 369th monthly installment date, plus interest accrued to the date of the prepayment.

5. The Purchase Agreement provided:

"Simultaneously with your purchase of the Leasehold, you and the Seller will execute, acknowledge and deliver an Agreement in the form of Exhibit C hereto (the "Repurchase Agreement") providing for the consolidation and merger of the lien of the Construction Mortgage with the right, title and interest to be assigned by the Assignment and for the repurchase by the Seller of the Leasehold as merged with the lien of the Construction Mortgage."

6. The Consolidation Agreement, the tax on the recording of which is the subject of this review, provided:

"The Seller and the Purchaser hereby consolidate and merge the lien of the Assigned Mortgage with

this bis one made suparests for the entire

interestable de la company de

තුන වර්ග්රහනු ලැබුණු වැට විශ්ය වැනිම දින්ගෙන පෙන්වා නිරාව වැනිම විසින් වියින් මා විවිධ විසින් විසින් වෙන්න කරන කරන කරන දින්නේ වෙන කරන කරන කරන කරන කරන වන වෙන වෙන වෙන වෙන වෙන වෙන කරන විසින් විශ්ය විශ්ය

อาราคาร์ และเมื่อ " และกลาด" พระเทศนาการ์ เมื่อดีก "และ " แบบไม้ได้ อนกับก | การ์ โพทานาลเลยทรงและ "อาการ์ เมื่อเหตุ ได้เมื่อ " เพียง ได้ เมื่อ และ และ ได้ ได้เรียง เมื่อเกาะ ได้เกียง and into the right, title and interest assigned to the Seller under the Assignment. The Seller hereby agrees to purchase said right, title and interest, as merged and consolidated with said lien, subject to, and in accordance with, the terms and prévisions of this Agreement, for the purchase price specified in section 3. Such sale shall be limited to the right, title and interest acquired by the Seller under the Assignment, as consolidated and merged with the lien of the Assigned Mortgage, ***.

- 7. Following the assignment of the Leasehold by Taxpayer to Hancock on June 30, 1970, and their contemporaneous entry into the Consolidation Agreement on the same date, Taxpayer assigned its interest therein to Associates.
- Since the closing of the transaction between Taxpayer and Hancock was scheduled to take place in Boston, Massachusetts, on June 30, 1970, and it was necessary to deposit in escrow with The Title Guarantee Company, prior to June 30, 1970, an executed copy of the Consolidation Agreement and executed copies of two other instruments to be recorded, so that they all could be recorded on June 30, 1970, upon telephone instructions from the attorneys for Hancock and Taxpayer at the Boston closing, taxpayer's attorney on June 23, 1970, hand delivered to the New York County Mortgage Tax Examiner copies of the Consolidation Agreement, together with a copy of a proposed affidavit by Taxpayer's president claiming exemption under section 255 of the Tax Law from the payment of mortgage tax upon the recording of the Consolidation Agreement, with the request that the Mortgage Tax Examiner stamp the backs of the instruments and fill in the recording charges and indicate that no mortgage tax would be due. After examining the instruments, the Mortgage Tax Examiner complied with this request

The Anticome server is a contract the contract of the contract

古教的主体教学的教育的

end graven end interdent of the transfer of the first of the constant for the constant of the constant and the constant end of the constant end of

ing from the contract of the contraction of the second of the contract of the oge (natable received the native of the content of the content of the content of the first of the content. Talan trada garagana gita di sasari. Tar orkaranyan galar ya Tala Gitari Gitaria Gitaria delign to refer the later of the later of the property of the contract of the teriso long to beinger ti resone for dreiger binderstillenes ein in Ho Palacobole activities the second calcinos, being about the consecution ant le burnoute elle din la lenguagnera. Lenguagnera l'antique l'antique l'antique l'antique l'antique l'antique The control of the process of the state of the same of the same and the same of the control of t $\sigma_{m{Q}}$ and $\sigma_{m{Q}}$ the feet apply opening of the hope and apply the body to be at the control of the case of the case of the case weighted and to all to a soften to be a family as a second of the control of the trad described with manifer sections of the first best discounted by all residences of the executions of . The living to a single for the state of the state of the state of the leave of the second section is a second second section of the second s say of the second sept of the spirit of the set of second second is second to The state of the contract of t the transmission to the second of the second and second the first constitution of

and endorsed on the face page of the Consolidation Agreement a statement to the effect that same was to be recorded without payment of mortgage tax, per section 255 affidavit, subject to review by the State Tax Commission.

9. On July 28, 1970, the Associate Mortgage and Land Tax Examiner, Arthur Maxwell, notified the Register of New York County that a new mortgage tax should have been paid when the Consolidation Agreement was recorded and that the amount of tax should have been based upon the appraised value of the property secured by said Consolidation Agreement.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- A. That the Consolidation Agreement was not a supplemental mortgage entitled to exemption from the tax on mortgages under section 255 of the Tax Law. It was an executory contract of sale of the ground lease by John Hancock under which the Taxpayer, as purchaser, was entitled to possession and it constituted security for the purchase price and was therefore a mortgage subject to the tax on recording mortgages. It did not extend nor was it supplemental to the mortgage recorded on March 13, 1968, which was extinguished by merger into the ground lease when both were acquired by John Hancock.
- B. That the Consolidation Agreement was in effect a mortgage for an indefinite amount of not less than \$5,500,000.00 since it provided, in addition to certain fixed payments of said sum, for annual variable payments based upon a share of the operating profits of the secured property and therefore pursuant to section 256 of the Tax Law the mortgage tax should have been computed upon the

atatament to the charteness of the section of the control of the control of the charteness of the charteness of the control of

An application of the committation approach was at many about the constitution of the

appraised value of the property secured by the Consolidation

C. That the application of the Taxpayer is denied and the determination contained in the letter dated July 28, 1970, of Arthur Maxwell, Associate Mortgage and Land Tax Examiner, Miscellaneous Tax Bureau, is sustained.

DATED: Albany, New York
May 9, 1972

STATE TAX COMMISSION

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

appeatand veins of the proporty recurse of the Camerina conse

G. Instant and contained the transfer on the design of the design of the design of the design of the contained and the contained design of the design of the

Miscalleagous law receas to sustained.

PATES ANDROY, USW TOR

SUATE CAN COMPLETION

TO MATERIANAL

COMMENSIONER

SCHOOL SECTIONS TO

STATE OF NEW MORN STATE TAN CONTESSION MAY 17 1972

SECRETARY

IN THE MATTER OF THE ADMITTANT OF

200 E, 64th ST. CORP.

ATTIDAVIT OF MAILING

JOHN HANCOCK MUTUAL LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY

State of New Mork) ss. City and County of Albany)

Arthur Maxwell

, being duly sworn, deposes and

That your deponent is over the age of eighteen and an employee in the Office of the State Tax Commission, Department of Taxation and Winance, Mortgage & Real Estate Transfer Tax Section.

That on the day of 197, your deponent deposited in a letter box exclusively maintained and controlled by the United States Government at

in the City and County of Albany, mew ork, a copy of the determination of the State Tax Commission in this proceeding, copy of which is hereto annexed, contained in a securely closed, postpaid cover, directed to the herein below named parties in this proceeding, their representatives and the recording officer of New York County at the addresses set forth below:

Fred A. Baker

Sworn to before me this

15th day

of

w.

1 2

200 E. 64th St. Corp. c/o I. Dinson
131 East 17th Street
New York, New York

Berg, Mezansky & Dorf, Esqs. 350 5th Avenue New York, New York

John Hancock Musual Life Insurance Company 200 Berkeley Street Boston, Massachusetts 02117

Hon. J. Lee Rankin Corporation Counsel City of New York Municipal Building New York, New York

Mr. Victor M. Rivera Register - New York 31 Chambers Street New York, New York 10007